

Cory R. Laird
Lance P. Jasper
REEP, BELL, LAIRD & JASPER, P.C.
P.O. Box 16960
2955 Stockyard Road
Missoula, Montana 59808-6960
Telephone: (406) 541-4100
Facsimile: (406) 541-4101
Email: jasper@westernmontanalaw.com
Email: laird@westernmontanalaw.com

Attorneys for Defendant Paul O'Neill in his individual capacity

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF MONTANA
GREAT FALLS DIVISION

ANA SUDA and MARTHA HERNANDEZ,) CV-19-10-GF-BMM

COMES NOW, Defendant Paul O'Neill ("Mr. O'Neill"), by and through his attorneys of record, Reep, Bell, Laird & Jasper, P.C., and pursuant to Rule 12(b)(6) of Federal Rules of Civil Procedure respectfully submits his

1 reply brief in support of his motion to partially dismiss the Plaintiffs'
2 Complaint.

3 **ARGUMENT**

4 Mr. O'Neill, in his individual capacity, has moved this Court for an
5 order dismissing the Plaintiffs' claims against him for declaratory and
6 injunctive relief. In response, the Plaintiffs state they "have not sought such
7 relief against Defendant O'Neill in his individual capacity, only in his official
8 capacity" and "[t]o the extent the Complaint might be read to include such
9 prospective claims against him individually" they "have no objection to the
10 dismissal of those claims only as to Defendant O'Neill in his individual
11 capacity." Doc. 40 at 3. Therefore, Mr. O'Neill's partial motion to dismiss
12 should be granted, and the claims for declaratory and injunctive relief
13 against him should be dismissed.

14 To ensure the record is clear, Mr. O'Neill must address the contention
15 made in Plaintiffs' response brief that he "does not contest that Plaintiffs'
16 constitutional rights were violated." *Id.* at 2. This is a gross
17 mischaracterization of Mr. O'Neill's position. In his opening brief, Mr.
18 O'Neill specifically states "[f]or the purposes of this motion, Mr. O'Neill
19 takes the Plaintiff's Complaint as *alleged*, withholding any position on the
20 veracity of the allegations contained therein." Doc. 31 at 3:6–8 (emphasis

1 original). Mr. O'Neill has applied the legal standard for Rule 12(b)(6)
2 motions, which is to take the allegations of the complaint as alleged and
3 assert grounds for dismissal even if they were true. *Ashcroft v. Iqbal*, 556
4 U.S. 662, 678 (2009). Mr. O'Neill does not concede or admit that a
5 violation of the Plaintiffs' constitutional rights occurred.

6 To the extent the Plaintiffs are attempting to argue for a tacit
7 admission to the allegations contained in their complaint, Mr. O'Neill makes
8 no such admission, expressly or impliedly.

9 **CONCLUSION**

10 Based on the Plaintiffs own statements, Mr. O'Neill's partial motion to
11 dismiss should be granted.

12 DATED this 18th day of July, 2019.

13 REEP, BELL, LAIRD & JASPER, P.C.

14 By: /s/ Cory R. Laird
15 Attorneys for Defendant Paul O'Neill

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing document was served on the following persons by the following means:

- 1-6 CM-ECF
 - Hand Delivery
 - Mail
 - Overnight Delivery Service
 - Fax
 - E-Mail

1. Clerk, United States District Court for the District of Montana.
 2. Alex Rate
Elizabeth Ehret
American Civil Liberties Union of Montana Foundation, Inc.
P.O. Box 1968
Missoula, Montana 59806
ratea@aclumontana.org
ehrete@aclumontana.org
 3. Danielle Coffman
Crowley Fleck, PLLP
1667 Whitefish State
Kalispell, Montana 59901
dcoffman@crowleyfleck.com
 4. Cody Wofsy
America Civil Liberties Union Foundation, Immigrants' Rights Project
39 Drumm Street
San Francisco, California 94111
cwofsy@aclu.org
 5. Omar C. Jadwat
American Civil Liberties Union Foundation, Immigrants' Rights Project
125 Broad Street, 18th Floor
New York, New York 10004
ojadwat@aclu.org

1 6. Victoria L. Francis
2 Assistant U.S. Attorney
3 U.S. Attorney's Office
4 2601 2nd Avenue, North, Suite 3200
5 Billings, Montana 59101
6 victoria.francis@usdoj.gov

7 7. Chad C. Spraker
8 Assistant U.S. Attorneys
9 U.S. Attorney's Office
10 901 Front Street, Suite 1100
11 Helena, Montana 59626
12 chad.spraker@usdoj.gov

13 DATED this 18th day of July, 2019.

14 REEP, BELL, LAIRD & JASPER, P.C.

15 By: /s/ Cory R. Laird
16 Attorneys for Defendant Paul O'Neill

CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE

The undersigned hereby certifies this Brief complies with LR 7.1(d)(2)(B). This reply brief contains 339 words, excluding the caption, Certificate of Service and the Certificate of Compliance. The word count function in the word processing software used to prepare this reply brief was relied upon for this calculation.

By: /s/ Cory R. Laird
Attorneys for Defendant Paul O'Neill